



FORT ST. ELMO & ENVIRONS

Development Brief

Approved



Commissioned by the
Grand Harbour Regeneration Corporation

December 2011

**Malta Environment and Planning Authority
P.O.Box
Marsa GPO 01
Malta**

**Tel: (356) 2290 0000
Fax: (356) 2290 2295
website: <http://www.mepa.org.mt>**

ISBN – 978-99957-26-15-7

Table of Contents

1.0	Introduction	1
2.0	Site History, Description and Tenure	3
3.0	Planning Goals and Objectives	7
4.0	Land Use Framework	9
5.0	Conservation of Historic Fabric	16
6.0	Urban Design Framework	17
7.0	Site Access, Circulation and Parking	21
8.0	Utilities	23
9.0	Submission Requirements	25

APPENDICES

A	Policy Context
B	Photos of Site
C	Public Submissions with MEPA Responses

List of Maps

Map 1	Regional Context
Map 2	Current Land Uses
Map 3	Existing Buildings and Landmarks
Map 4	Identity Areas
Map 5	Proposed Land Uses and Conditions

1.0 Introduction

For the context of this chapter, the term "Fort St. Elmo" refers to the original Fort, the Carafa Enceinte, the Carafa Esplanade, the landfront ditch and granaries as one military complex.

- 1.1 Fort St. Elmo is one of the most significant historic landmarks in Malta (Map 1). It occupies a strategic position at the tip of the Sceberras peninsula upon which the Order of St. John founded the city of Valletta. From a military point of view it was crucial in safeguarding access to the Marsamxett and Grand Harbours, on both sides of Valletta. The original Fort was constructed by the Knights in the mid-sixteenth century and it played an important role not only during the Great Siege of 1565 but even in the twentieth century during World War II.
- 1.2 The Fort is representative of both the legacy of the Knights of the Order of St. John and to a lesser extent of other additions that date to the British period in Malta. Today, the Fort is partially utilised as the headquarters of the Police Academy, the office for the Refugees Commission, and a building situated within the Fort's outerworks accommodates the War Museum. Part of the enceinte is being used by the Valletta Rehabilitation Project (VRP) to store building material for current works in Valletta. Unfortunately, in spite of its considerable historical value, access to Fort St. Elmo by local visitors and tourists is restricted. Various parts of the Fort complex particularly those areas flanking the outer bastions have become derelict and have deteriorated even more so due to their exposure to the natural elements. Apart from the area administered by the Police Academy, over the last two decades there has been no maintenance of the Fort. Development permission was granted in 2010 for the demolition of five non historical accretions and the repair works to two building blocks in the original Fort St. Elmo and a World War II gun emplacement located along Abercrombie bastion in order to render them safe prior to the envisaged restoration.
- 1.3 The environment around Fort St. Elmo is characterised by the concentration of residential neighbourhoods. A considerable number of residential tenements are of substandard quality. Comparatively, few tourists and local visitors venture towards the lower end of Valletta. There are very limited commercial and office facilities within this part of the capital city.
- 1.4 Any future proposal for the rehabilitation of Fort St. Elmo and its immediate environs should serve as a catalyst for the rehabilitation and upgrading of the lower sector of Valletta. The Fort could be restored and rehabilitated as a major tourist venue and would incorporate a number of cultural attractions and visitor facilities. Besides the rehabilitation and re-use of the Fort itself, it is also of paramount importance that the surrounding public spaces be upgraded as attractive environments for both the local community and visitors.

- 1.5 This development brief is intended to provide the basic framework for any future rehabilitation of the Fort and its surroundings. It sets out the various parameters and outlines environmentally compatible strategies by which to utilise to the full the potential of the area without compromising its unique historical value. It outlines the nature and types of compatible development for Fort St. Elmo and its surroundings and also indicates other buildings and areas in the vicinity for which rehabilitation or redevelopment is considered advisable in line with the overall objectives of this brief. The brief will also consider various aspects of the rehabilitation of Fort St. Elmo within the context of the Grand Harbour area including historic conservation and design issues, transportation, services and infrastructure.

2.0 Site History, Description and Tenure

History of Fort St. Elmo

- 2.1 When the Knights of the Order of St. John arrived in Malta in 1530 they set up their base in the maritime town of Birgu and Fort St. Angelo. However from a strategic military point of view it soon became apparent that any defence of the Grand Harbour and Marsamxett necessitated a Fort at the tip of the Sceberras peninsula.
- 2.2 The Order was however in a dire financial situation and the first of a series of proposals to build a Fort on Mount Sceberras was made to the Grand Master De Homedes by Antonio Ferrandino da Bergamo in 1541. It was mainly due to the efforts of the Italian Knight, Fra Leone Strozzi, that Fort St. Elmo was finally constructed on the barren rock at the tip of Mount Sceberras.
- 2.3 In 1551 after a scathing attack by the Turks when they had pillaged and ransacked the island with hardly any opposition, Strozzi made a case for the immediate need to build a Fort to strengthen the harbour defences. On 8th January 1552, Grand Master Juan de Homedes instructed Fra Leone Strozzi together with Fra George Bombast, Fra Louis Lastic and Pietro Prato to design and supervise the construction of Fort St. Elmo. The designers of the Fort were only given six months, up till June, to complete its construction. The original chapel of St. Elmo was retained within the walls of the Fort.
- 2.4 The Fort was a small star-shaped design with angled bastions. The walls were relatively thin and they were no higher than the level of the ground behind the Fort. The Fort lacked any outworks as is normally the case. Its purpose was to defend against any invaders from the sea and it afforded no protection from any land invasion.
- 2.5 After valiantly holding out for more than a month during the Great Siege of 1565, Fort St. Elmo was completely destroyed. Plans for rebuilding the Fort were taken in hand immediately after the siege by the Italian military Francesco Laparelli. Laparelli designed the grid-iron street plan for a new city, Valletta, which was to be built on the Sceberras peninsula. The new Fort St. Elmo was one of the first structures to be completed. The original design in the form of a star was retained but with stronger walls and deeper ditches. In 1689 a new series of Fortifications known as the Carafa bastions were designed by Don Carlos de Gruninberg and built under the supervision of the Order's French military engineer, Mederico Blondel.
- 2.6 During the course of the eighteenth century various barracks were built around the internal piazza within the Fort. During the long reign of Grand Master Pinto (1741 - 1773), nineteen large vaulted magazines on three floors were constructed in the outworks along the Carafa Bastions. These structures were intended for the storage of food and as a shelter for women and children in the event of a siege.

- 2.7 Within the precincts of Fort St. Elmo are two religious buildings. The old chapel which had existed since 1488 was incorporated near the gate to the Fort, referred to as 'del Soccorso'. The chapel was re-dedicated to St. Anne in the mid-sixteenth century. The church although of modest dimensions is embellished with ornate stone carvings that date to the seventeenth century.
- 2.8 Another church also dedicated to St. Anne and which has an early eighteenth century Baroque facade overlooking the piazza was desecrated during the British period and its interior was completely remodelled.
- 2.9 During the British period, between 1866 and 1877, the defensive outworks were strengthened by the construction of a series of gun emplacements and embrasures on the spurs of the Cavaliers facing the harbour. Within the bastion walls of Fort St. Elmo are buried two distinguished British officers who are General Sir Ralph Abercrombie and the first British Governor of Malta, Sir Alexander Ball.
- 2.10 A circular stone light-house some 56 feet in height and a total of 206 feet above sea-level used to dominate the skyline of Fort St. Elmo and served as a guiding beacon to incoming ships. This lighthouse was demolished in 1940 for security reasons as it could have served as a landmark for the enemy aircraft in World War II.
- 2.11 The ditch of the Fort used to house gardens (physic gardens) which provided a source of medicinal plants for the Sacra Infermeria of the Order. These gardens were later transferred to Floriana by Sir Alexander Ball in the early nineteenth century.
- 2.12 As from 1988, the Police Academy was accommodated within the precincts of Fort St. Elmo - Refer to Map 2 for the present land-uses of the whole Fort St. Elmo complex and its environs.

Site Description

- 2.13 Fort St. Elmo is situated at the tip of the peninsula upon which the capital city of Valletta was constructed to the plan of Francesco Laparelli. The Fort safeguards the entry to the two natural harbours, the Marsamxett Harbour and the Grand Harbour. The Fort complex is surrounded on three sides by the sea and its landfront is connected to the rest of the city by a stretch of land some seven hundred metres wide. The British had intended to cut the rock from the Grand Harbour to Marsamxett and to transform the Fort into an island. However due to the considerable financial outlay required they abandoned the project.
- 2.14 The two principal streets of Valletta, Republic Street and Merchants' Street stretch from the main entrance of the city all the way to Fort St. Elmo. The unobstructed visual

sightlines along these straight streets permit distant views of the Fort from the upper and central parts of Valletta.

- 2.15 Fort St. Elmo Development Brief area has an approximate footprint of 9.25 ha. This includes the original Fort and the later additions at the Carafa esplanade, the extended outworks along the bastions, the ditch and granaries in front of the Fort, the Evans building, the Examination Centre and the foreshore. The confines of the Fort are all bounded within the bastion walls of a changing profile. On the landfront side there is a deeply cut ditch. The highest point of the Fort is circa 50 metres above sea-level.
- 2.16 On the basis of its significant historic value, Fort St. Elmo, the esplanade and enceinte were listed under the (now repealed) Antiquities Protection Act of 1925. In 2001, these areas were scheduled as a Grade 1 monument under the Development Planning Act and the Cultural Heritage Act. Within the Fort, the small chapel of 'del Soccorso' deserves special protection. Besides the extensive bastion walls, the main architectural elements of historic value include the upper and lower parade ground, the magazines surrounding the internal piazza, the gate houses and the gun emplacements. Map 3 indicates the period during which the various individual structures within the Fort complex were built. These can be classified into the period of the Order of St. John, the British period and the post-British era.
- 2.17 The Fort is presently utilised by the Malta Police as the quarters of the Police Academy. (Refer to Map 2 for Current Land Uses). It accommodates within the barracks a number of lecture rooms, office and service facilities. The internal piazza and parts of the outer ditch are utilised as training grounds for the police cadets. The facilities of the Police Academy are contained within the precincts of Fort St. Elmo. The main entrance is not from the landfront but from the gate along Triq il-Mediterran, in front of the Mediterranean Conference Centre. Adjoining this entrance gate is a small building which serves as a tourist facility for the screening of the *Malta Experience*. There is also the Commission of Refugees which is housed within the Fort. Valletta Rehabilitation Project also uses part of the enceinte to store building material.
- 2.18 The main gate of the Fort is accessible from the landfront glacis or granaries by means of a stone bridge over the ditch. The approach from the main gate leads through a vaulted passageway to the upper parade ground.
- 2.19 The Drill Hall which is accessible from Triq l-Ixprun, today houses the War Museum including a small yard in front of the museum. The lower parade ground is bounded on one side by a three-storey block known as the Pinto Magazines. A number of individual buildings in the lower parade ground are in a dilapidated state. There is also a long water tank near the Vendome bastion with a capacity of over a million gallons. The Pinto Stores have for a number of years been used by the Carnival floats builders. This use has adversely affected the state of conservation of this building.

- 2.20 In front of the landfront Fortifications of Fort St. Elmo, the open glacis contains underground bell-shaped granaries which were used for the storage of wheat. Today, the granaries are no longer in use. Parking on the granaries is prohibited.
- 2.21 The ditch of the Fort is partly used as a training ground by the Police Academy.
- 2.22 The Examination Centre and the Evans Building are incorporated in the Development Brief because of their proximity to Fort St. Elmo and due to their potential re-utilisation within the parameters of the brief. The Examination Centre is occasionally used to house students for public examinations. The Evans Building accommodates a number of Government Departments including the Electoral Office and the Malta Standards Authority.
- 2.23 The ring road presently cuts through part of the ditch at a point very close to one of the points of the star shaped bastion wall. Therefore the present road cuts off a section of the ditch.
- 2.24 The seaward part of the Fort Complex is characterised by the curtain walls rising from the rocky foreshore. This area of the foreshore around the Fort St. Elmo complex is indicated by the Grand Harbour Local Plan as a Site of Scientific Importance / Area of Ecological Importance.

Land and Property Ownership

- 2.25 The Fort St. Elmo complex is under government ownership with the Fort being currently entrusted to the Police Academy. The Commission for Refugees is also housed here. The Evans Building is government property. The Examination Centre falls under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education.
- 2.26 It is imperative that issues relating to relocation of current uses is given a high priority and be tackled from the beginning of the redevelopment projects so as not to impede private sector initiatives.

3.0 Planning Goals and Objectives

3.1 The goal of this development brief is:

to restore, regenerate and rehabilitate Fort St. Elmo and its environs into a cultural and tourist attraction with supporting amenities to attract visitors and economic activity to the lower end of Valletta.

3.2 Although the brief area offers several potential opportunities for rehabilitation it is presently both economically and socially marginalised from the rest of the capital city. The rehabilitation of the Fort St. Elmo and its Environs aspires to revive this run-down part of Valletta and would seek to attract both local visitors and tourists to visit the area. This would have the positive effect of injecting much needed revenue within the local community.

3.3 Valletta's central axis will be reinforced with the redevelopment of the main entrance to the City, the recent pedestrianisation of St. George's Square and the restoration and reinstatement of the historical integrity of the Grandmaster's Palace. The rehabilitation of Fort St. Elmo at the lower end of Valletta would create a further dynamic pole of cultural and tourism activities at the end of Valletta's central axis.

3.4 The main objectives can be listed as follows:

- To seek the conservation of the buildings, structures and spaces of historical, architectural and archaeological value within the development brief area through proper rehabilitation and restoration techniques;
- To establish a heritage route within the precincts of the Fort complex, accessible both to local visitors and tourists. This would serve as a cultural and recreational facility and would promote public appreciation of the local historic heritage;
- To encourage the use of Fort St. Elmo, for recreation, culture and tourist / visitor attractions with the bulk of other uses such as retail, catering, offices and tourist accommodation concentrated in the Carafa Esplanade;
- To encourage residential / offices / tourism accommodation uses on the site of the Evans Building;
- To encourage the use of the Examination Centre for education /offices / culture;
- To consider the appropriate number of car parking spaces supported by a Traffic Impact Statement provided their number does not prejudice a holistic transport strategy for Valletta and their location does not have an adverse impact on the historic, architectural and archaeological integrity and value of the development brief area.

- 3.5 The establishment of cultural facilities on historic themes within Fort St. Elmo, such as the 1565 Great Siege and World War II with specific reference to the role of the Fort, the Heritage Route, with tourism accommodation and office space will assist in bringing visitors to the Fort complex on a daily basis. The establishment of catering facilities including tea-rooms and cafes would not only cater for tourists but also for local weekend visitors.
- 3.6 The rehabilitation of the Fort St. Elmo complex should also generate other opportunities for retail and tourist-related outlets not only within the precincts of the complex but in the adjoining neighbourhoods. It would be beneficial in terms of the generation of employment opportunities both during the short-term construction phase and also as part of a long-term strategy for the future management of the facilities within the Fort.
- 3.7 The future use of the Evans Building and the Examination Centre will have a direct impact on the setting of the Fort and the integration of these sites in this Brief will serve to achieve the objective of the conservation of the Fort complex itself and also serve as an opportunity for development.
- 3.8 Although not directly the remit of MEPA, transportation issues still need to be taken into account when considering new development, especially in the context of Valletta where transportation strategies are still evolving. MEPA will seek to ensure that the development proposals encouraged by this Brief will not compromise both national and local transport policies. Provision of car parking is a crucial element of any transport plan for Valletta.
- 3.9 The proposed rehabilitation and redevelopment will take place within:
- (i) the Fort St. Elmo complex including Fort St. Elmo itself, Carafa Enceinte and Carafa Esplanade;
 - (ii) the present site of the block partially occupied by the Evans Building; and
 - (iii) the Examination Centre.
- 3.10 Thus, there are three physically separate areas earmarked for development in this Brief. The development projects will take into account the compatibility of uses in the case of historical buildings and structures. Consideration will also be given to the physical separation of facilities such as the residential units and retail / commercial uses.
- 3.11 Any proposed redevelopment should give high priority to minimising the traffic impact on the surrounding road network and special emphasis is to be given to public transport and the creation of zones for pedestrians.

4.0 Land-Use Framework

4.1 The proposed development for Fort St. Elmo and its environs will include the following land-uses:

- (i) Fort St. Elmo - Cultural facilities with supporting retail and catering;
- (ii) Carafa Esplanade - Cultural, Educational, Commercial uses including tourist accommodation, catering outlets, retail outlets, and office development;
- (iii) Carafa Enceinte - Heritage trail, recreational and cultural.
- (iv) Landfront Ditch – publicly accessible Physic garden;
- (v) Evans Building – Commercial Complex including tourist accommodation, residential units, office space with potential underground car park.
- (vi) Examination Centre – educational, office and cultural.

The choice of the appropriate uses and their scale in terms of floorspace for the Carafa Esplanade, the Evans Building and the Examination Centre shall be determined through the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and Conservation Management Plan formulation processes as required by paras 5.1 to 5.4 and 9.1 to 9.3 below.

4.2 The development brief area has been divided into the following identity areas (Refer to Map 4):

- 1. Fort St. Elmo
- 2. Carafa Esplanade
- 3. Carafa Enceinte
- 4. The landfront ditch of Fort St. Elmo
- 5. The Evans Building
- 6. The Examination Centre
- 7. The pedestrian precinct
- 8. The foreshore

Identity Area 1 – Fort St. Elmo

4.3 The old Fort with its buildings and structures dating from the period of the Knights and the British era has considerable potential to attract tourists and local visitors. Any proposed rehabilitation project should entail the reuse of the existing structures within the Fort for cultural and tourism attractions related facilities. This would serve as the main cultural focus and should be a major tourist venue.

4.4 The preferred use for the existing buildings is one related to museums including limited ancillary museum facilities such as a tourist souvenir shop, restaurant or tea rooms. The possibility of locating an audio-visual facility within these barracks should be considered. Emphasis will be on the restoration and conversion of existing buildings without any major new constructions. Guided tours for tourists within the Fort including the possibility of hosting a visual documentary within the Fort should prove to be compatible with the historic heritage of the Fort.



Plate 1: Fort St. Elmo

- 4.5 The piazza which forms the upper parade ground and is surrounded by barrack structures is ideal for outdoor activities in summer such as temporary exhibitions, *son et lumiere* shows, musical recitals and other performing arts and temporary commercial outlets. However, the placing of table and chairs with associated paraphernalia within the parade grounds as extensions to catering outlets are not deemed suitable for this space as they would detract from the appreciation of the historic space and the surrounding buildings and create visual clutter. Such furniture is more suitable in the open space of the filled ditch located between the Cavalier and one of the barrack buildings. Public access to this open space needs to be ensured and pedestrian flow safeguarded.
- 4.6 There exists the possibility of reconstructing the old lighthouse on the Cavalier. The strategic vertical structure may serve as a viewing platform for visitors besides a landmark beacon within the Grand Harbour and Marsamxett region.
- 4.7 The chapel near the '*Porta del Soccorso*' and St. Anne's Church would be restored and would serve as a significant historical attraction within the Fort. The chapel near the *Porta del Soccorso* should retain its religious function while other uses supporting the cultural hub in the Fort can be considered for St. Anne's Church.
- 4.8 The old Fort has three separate entrances: the main entrance known as the '*Porta Principale*' which lies across the bridge along the Fort's landfront through the gatehouse into a passage hewed through the bastion walls and emerging into the upper parade ground. A second entrance is the '*Porta del Soccorso*' behind the internal angle of the south and north-east spurs. This gateway which had been blocked after the Siege was widened during the 17th century for the easier passage of carts. It has subsequently been restored. The two entrances can serve as an independent entrance and exit for the visitors within the Fort. A third access links the Fort to the parade grounds within the Carafa Esplanade below over a narrow path projecting from the outer wall of the Cavalier leading to a small doorway to the filled ditch.

Identity Area 2 – Carafa Esplanade

- 4.9 Presently the War Museum is accommodated within the Drill Hall which is accessible from the public road and lies outside the main confines of the Fort complex. The possibility exists of relocating the entrance within the context of the pedestrian tourist circulation route along Carafa Enceinte.
- 4.10 The imposing three storey Pinto stores with later British additions can be restored and rehabilitated without major additional constructions for commercial uses including tourist accommodation, food and beverage outlets, retail outlets, office accommodation and educational purposes whilst respecting its historical value.
- 4.11 The parade ground in the Carafa Esplanade is the least accessible part of the whole Fort complex. In order to attract visitors to this area, innovative activities in this parade ground will be considered.



Plate 2: Carafa Esplanade - Pinto Stores and the Parade Ground

- 4.12 The entrance to Carafa Enceinte and Carafa Esplanade could be independent of that leading to Fort St. Elmo. The ramp linking the Esplanade to Fort St. Elmo is to be retained and remain fully accessible to the public. An effective link between the Esplanade and the Fort, together with the land front ditch, will facilitate the flow of visitors through the site and provide more opportunities for an enjoyable experience.
- 4.13 The bomb-proof Vendome water tank structures adjacent to the lower parade ground in the Esplanade should be retained and restored for their original use. The historic Vendome water-fountain and the accompanying Doric colonnade would be retained and restored as elements within the proposed design.
- 4.14 The ruins of the Officer's Quarters may be developed to complement the uses in the Pinto Stores as set out under 4.1 (ii) above. New constructions or even total redevelopment may be considered by the Conservation Management Plan which will include an assessment of the conservation significance of these ruins. This site of 1,500 sq m provides the main opportunity for the insertion of new architecture in the Fort.

Identity Area 3 - Carafa Enceinte

- 4.15 The Carafa Enceinte consists of bastions with curtain walls connecting them, namely St. Lazarus, Abercrombie, Sir Alexander Ball and St. Gregory. The Enceinte enjoys spectacular panoramic views across both harbours.

4.16 There are a number of derelict structures and buildings which may not have any historical significance. No major new development or reconstruction of demolished buildings will be considered.

4.17 Various historic structures along the Enceinte, including the arcaded chambers abutting Abercrombie Curtain wall, are to be renovated.

4.18 A Heritage Route will be developed along the bastions with appropriate paving and landscaping commencing from the site of 'The Malta Experience' building all along the outerworks of the Fort and the Carafa bastions behind the Pinto magazines and reaching the Drill Hall or current location of the War Museum and extending into the Esplanade along the existing ramp and into the land front ditch with possible links to the Fort from the existing passage and staircase



Plate 3: Pomerium on St. Gregory curtain

and back onto the Enceinte. Tourists and local visitors will be able to walk along the Heritage Route which would be planned along the outer bastions. Panoramic views as experienced from the Heritage Route would be given special consideration. The commemorative burial plaques / memorials of Sir Alexander Ball and General Abercrombie and their setting will be restored and would be integrated as part of the Heritage Route. The VRP storage facility would have to be relocated from its present location.

4.19 The possibility of expanding the War Museum is to be investigated, using existing historic structures along the Enceinte which are to be duly restored for this purpose or other cultural uses.

4.20 The World War II anti-aircraft pill-boxes and concrete gun emplacements would be retained and restored as they are representative of the Fort St. Elmo complex as a war-machine. The stone structures with pitched roofs along the outer fortification walls would be restored and may be considered for small exhibition display areas. Historical information on the Fort could be displayed in the form of installations set up within these structures.

Identity Area 4 - The landfront Ditch of Fort St. Elmo

4.21 During the time of the Knights, the landfront ditch served as a Physic garden and serviced the Sacra Infermeria of the Order. Presently, part of the ditch is used by the Police Academy as a training obstacle course. The Physic gardens may be reinstated within the framework of a comprehensive landscaping scheme and will be made accessible to the public, linked through the Carafa Esplanade with the Heritage Route

on the Carafa Enceinte. Any incompatible structures that abut onto the ditch walls will be demolished in line with the Conservation Management Plan.

- 4.22 Special consideration and effort should be made to try to reinstate the ditch as a complete element. The possibility of reintegrating that part of the ditch which has been separated by the road should be considered.



Plate 4 – Landfront ditch

Identity Area 5 - The Evans Building

- 4.23 The site of the Evans Building used to form part of the *Sacra Infermeria* complex of the Order which included the Nibbia Chapel, scheduled as Class B archaeological ruin in 2008, the cemetery of the hospital, the Chapel of Bones and the anatomical theatre. Thus the site may be archaeologically sensitive. Some historians are of the opinion that the building should be considered for scheduling as it is an important example of post war reconstruction in Valletta, its style and built volume respects its context and any additions or alterations would have an adverse visual impact to the setting of the old hospital, Fort St. Elmo and the entrance to the Grand Harbour. Others are of the view that the Evans Building should be redeveloped as it is grossly inefficient in terms of the ratio of built-up land to the available confines of the site. The building is from an urban design viewpoint totally incompatible and is out of context with the historic urban fabric of Valletta.



Plate 5: Evans Building

- 4.24 In view of these diametrically opposing positions, the determination of the historical, architectural, and archaeological value of this site and the buildings and structures upon it will be determined through the Conservation Management Plan. A crucial recommendation of this plan shall be the retention or otherwise of the Evans Building and the potential for underground car parking on the site in view of the possibility of archaeological findings.
- 4.25 Independently of the decision on the existing building and any underground development, more cost effective uses are a residential complex, offices complex and/or tourism accommodation.

Identity Area 6 – The Examination Centre

4.26 The Examination Centre, restored in the early 2000's, lies immediately opposite the Granaries. The building occupied by the Centre could accommodate educational and office development which would be designed in consonance with the surrounding historical context. Cultural uses may also be located on this site.



Plate 6: Examination Centre

Identity Area 7 - The Pedestrian Precinct

4.27 The Granaries in front of the Fort are presently not used for any purpose. An alternative entrance to the Fort (in addition to Porta del Soccorso from the Carafa Enciente) will be provided from the entrance across the Granaries and over the stone bridge. This approach will provide a dignified entrance to the Fort and a full appreciation of its land front fortifications. Good drop zones for buses and tourist vehicles are required.

4.28 The space occupied by the Granaries and a segment of Triq il-Mediterran and Misrah Sant` Iermu may be potentially extended into a pedestrian priority area for informal outdoor activities and can be properly landscaped to accommodate this purpose. Part of the main road leading to Triq il-Mediterran can also be integrated as part of a pedestrian precinct. This will connect Misrah Sant' Iermu and the Granaries in front of the Fort. However, in view of the increased importance of the ring road for traffic flows and vehicular access into the Capital, the implications of this pedestrian priority area on the traffic flows need to be assessed as part of the TIS to ensure that it does not result in the shifting of considerable volumes of traffic onto the immediate inner streets of Valletta.



Plate 7: The Granaries in front of Fort St. Elmo

Identity Area 8 - The Foreshore

4.29 Free and unlimited pedestrian access to the foreshore around the Fort St. Elmo complex would be safeguarded. A development permission for the reconstruction of the historic cast-iron pedestrian bridge to the breakwater has been issued in 2009 and it should attract further visitors to the lower end of Valletta.

4.30 No structures will be permitted on the coastline. Any illegal and unsightly structures which clutter the foreshore would be demolished.

4.31 Access to the foreshore is by means of a staircase in front of the Mediterranean Conference Centre or from the tunnel beneath the English curtain. Although a sea ferry operating between Valletta and Sliema is a highly desirable objective, it currently operates during the summer months from the Sliema Ferry to a berthing place on the Marsamxett side. In view of the exposed nature of the site of the Fort St. Elmo, it is not advisable that a ferry facility be provided immediately outside the Fort. However, there may be direct transport services to the Fort complex from a more sheltered ferry terminal.



Plate 8: The Foreshore

5.0 Conservation of the Historic Fabric

- 5.1 The scheduling of Fort St. Elmo and its outerworks as a Grade 1 monument in 2001 requires the conservation of this feature of architectural and historical value and its setting. The development promoted by this Brief provides a unique opportunity to restore and rehabilitate this Fort complex in a sustainable manner by introducing new life into its fabric and the immediately surrounding environs (Evans Buildings, Exam Centre and the open spaces between them).
- 5.2 The conservation of the Fort and its environs would entail, primarily, a three stage process:
- (1) an assessment of the existing situation to establish and record in a detailed manner those buildings, structures and open spaces located within the development brief area of historic and architectural significance and those without;
 - (2) identification of the conservation issues such as lack of maintenance, or more specifically stone deterioration etc, any impacts from previous development and interventions;
 - (3) setting out of the intervention techniques necessary to achieve the restoration and rehabilitation for their intended use of those features which are worthy of protection.
- 5.3 The Conservation Management Plan formulation process, incorporating the requirements for a Restoration Method Statement, may provide the best methodology to implement these stages for those sites within the Brief area where the decision on the appropriate use and scale has not been determined by the Brief (see 4.1).
- 5.4 All historical buildings and structures within the Fort St. Elmo complex will have to be rehabilitated and restored under the supervision of qualified experts. Special attention should be provided to the rehabilitation of the following:
- (i) Bastions and curtain walls along the Fort including the cavalier and the Carafa outerworks;
 - (ii) barracks of the Order of St. John around the parade ground of Fort St. Elmo;
 - (iii) the church of St. Anne and the chapel near the Porta del Soccorso;
 - (iv) the 'Drill Hall' presently accommodating the War Museum;
 - (v) Pinto magazines in the Carafa Esplanade and the British-period Doric exedra around fountain;
 - (vi) the Vendome water reservoir;
 - (vii) World War II anti-aircraft pill-boxes and gun batteries;
 - (viii) memorial tombstones of Sir Alexander Ball and Abercrombie;
 - (ix) gate entrances to Fort St. Elmo.

6.0 Urban Design Framework

General Design Guidelines

- 6.1 As the Fort St. Elmo complex is of outstanding historical importance any proposed interventions within the development brief area have to respect this sensitive historic continuum and should not compete in terms of scale, mass and materials with the historic components of the Fort complex. However, the design process of grafting any new interventions onto the older building fabric should be an authentic architectural expression which does not introduce ambiguous historicist imitations. It is imperative that the existing historical structures and the new interventions be aesthetically distinct.
- 6.2 In the restoration and rehabilitation of existing historical structures, the traditional building material of local globigerina limestone will be utilised as much as possible. In such interventions it is highly desirable that any traditional construction systems be retained. Any new interventions may employ modern high-tech materials (refer to para 6.13 for materials on the Evans Building site). The use of reinforced concrete within the Fort and the Enceinte will be, in general, restricted. The style and scope of the many activities that will occupy the various sections of the Fort Complex need also to be given special consideration. It remains imperative, that the materials and styles chosen for the conversion of the interiors, services and signage are uniform and simple. The overall effect must enhance the Fort's austere, military features and not dominate or overshadow its architecture with clutter.
- 6.3 Landscaping within the Fort complex, the ditch and open spaces should contribute to the visual enhancement of the Fort and its fortifications. The landscaping design should seek to achieve the right balance between soft and hard landscaping elements. The Heritage Route along the fortifications will integrate the Fort's historical walk-way with the cultural and retail facilities within the Fort. A number of well designed temporary stalls and exhibition stands may form part of the landscaping scheme.
- 6.4 Special consideration will be given to ensure that the skyline of the Fort complex as viewed from both Tigne and Bighi/Ricasoli is safeguarded. It is also fundamental that the proposed development has no adverse effect on the Valletta/Floriana skyline. Valletta's traditional skyline characterised by the elegant spire of the Anglican Church and the massive dome of the Carmelite church should not be compromised.

Specific Design Issues

Fort St. Elmo

- 6.5 The development brief envisages the reuse of the Cavalier, the barracks surrounding the parade grounds and other structures from the British period at the upper level without any significant alterations both to the internal and external fabric.

- 6.6 The landscaping scheme for the outdoor spaces (parade grounds, filled ditch and other spaces between buildings) will need to pay specific attention to the colours, materials and pattern of the paving, lighting fixtures and space for the temporary structures which may be required for the outdoor activities. It would also need to take into account the suitability of the existing trees and shrubs and the introduction of new ones.

Carafa Esplande

- 6.7 This section of the site is made up of the Pinto magazines and the Officers' Quarters surrounding the parade ground which will be reused and of the War Museum and the Vendome water reservoir which will retain their existing use. Only minor alterations both to the internal and external fabric, except for the Officers' Quarters site, will be considered. While the Conservation Management Plan will identify the most appropriate interventions to accommodate the proposed range and scale of uses deemed acceptable by the EIA without damaging the integrity of the structures, any new development on the Officers' Quarters site shall not exceed the maximum height of the existing ruins. Any extensions to the original built footprint and additions to the original heights up to the maximum height should not unduly dominate the setting of the Vendome water-fountain and the accompanying Doric colonnade and its surroundings.
- 6.8 The requirements of the landscaping scheme for the parade grounds for Fort St. Elmo (para 6.6) will apply for the grounds and other outdoor spaces within this identity area.

Carafa Enceinte

- 6.9 The Brief designates this area for the establishment of a Heritage Route and will thus be the most publicly accessible part of the Fort complex. The success of this route will depend on the removal of unsightly accretions, the restoration of the architecturally and historically important monuments such as the Abercrombie and Sir Alexander Ball memorials and the World War II anti-aircraft batteries, and the design of the route itself. The design of the heritage route needs to consider specifically the movement patterns and seating areas for visitors, access for all, safety and durability of the materials used, interpretation panels, signage and lighting.

The landfront ditch of Fort St. Elmo

- 6.10 This area of the Fort is planned for the reinstatement of the Physic gardens. This proposal is for a very specialised form of garden and thus the choice of plants and trees and the way they are to be planted whether directly in the ditch's soil bed or in pots assumes significant importance and needs to be backed by historical research. Since this area will also be accessible to the public the other design issues identified for the Heritage Route in para 6.9 are also applicable. The replacement of the existing structure supporting Triq l-Ixprun with a more elegantly designed, single-span bridge, will provide

an opportunity to integrate the ditch as a holistic element and greatly enhance its visual appreciation.

The Evans Building

- 6.11 Due to the uncertainty surrounding the future of this building (retention or redevelopment) which will be resolved by the Conservation Management Plan, this section of the Brief provides design guidelines for both scenarios.
- 6.12 In the event of retention of the existing building, the Conservation Management Plan will identify the most appropriate interventions to accommodate the proposed range and scale of uses deemed acceptable by the EIA without damaging the integrity of the structure and no extensions to the existing footprint and height will be considered. No additional buildings will be permitted on the existing open space which should be upgraded and landscaped, integrating the remains of the Nibbia Chapel and some car parking.
- 6.13 In the event of redevelopment, the new building will be oriented with a view towards Fort Ricasoli and the Bighi Naval Hospital. The architectural design should adhere to a contextual modern approach which integrates with the surrounding urban texture. The elevation adjoining that of the Mediterranean Conference Centre should provide a space / piazza to compliment both the MCC and the new building and to retain the restored ruins of the Nibbia Chapel on site. The elevation along Merchants Street would be contextual and in visual harmony with the rest of the streetscape and Valletta's urban texture taking into account the Camarata block. All the facades should be in local globigerina limestone. The proposed height of the replacement building shall never exceed the existing height of the Evans Building and may be lowered to become in line with the proposed range and scale of uses deemed acceptable by the EIA. In the event of redevelopment with excavations, the levels below ground should be utilised to accommodate the appropriate number of car parking spaces as determined by the Traffic Impact Statement.

The Examination Centre

- 6.14 The development brief envisages the reuse of this building and infill development between the higher wings of the building may be worth investigating provided the existing maximum height of the Examination Centre site is not exceeded and the design, scale and massing of the extension respect the integrity of the Centre. The Conservation Management Plan will identify the most appropriate interventions to accommodate the proposed range and scale of uses and any additional development deemed acceptable by the EIA without damaging the integrity of the structures.

The pedestrian precinct

- 6.15 The Brief suggests the conversion of the open space defined by the landfront ditch of the Fort, the Evans Building, the Examination Centre, and the two residential blocks overlooking Misrah Sant Iermu into a pedestrian precinct, subject to a TIS, which would create an opportunity for informal outdoor activities. This space is composed of the Granaries and the tarmaced surfaces of Triq il-Mediterran, and Misrah Sant Iermu. The design scheme will need to consider traffic calming measures, drop off zones for buses and tourist vehicles, the location and materials of seating areas, landscaping features such as potted shrubs and trees along the periphery of the Granaries, lighting and signage, and different materials both in texture and colour within the road space to enable the identification of the pedestrian priority area. It must be ensured that all fixed features do not damage the historic elements of the area. The design should create an attractive public open space which also serves as a unifying element between the three portions of the development brief area.

The foreshore

- 6.16 The Brief requires the retention of public access to the foreshore. Visitors to this area will increase due to the attractions created and also with the reconstruction of the bridge to the breakwater. This may require some upgrading to the footpaths. Any interventions will need to be reversible where located on the natural rocky coast and would need to respect the designation of the foreshore as an AEI and SSI.

7.0 Site Access, Circulation and Parking

Vehicular Access to Site

- 7.1 Any proposed rehabilitation of the Fort St. Elmo complex and its environs should not entail the construction of new roads which would take up precious land or compromise the historical urban fabric of the area.
- 7.2 Traffic generation by any proposed redevelopment should utilise the peripheral ring road, around Valletta's bastions. Hence there will be no major impact on traffic circulation within the inner urban fabric of the capital city as vehicular access to the development brief area will by-pass the city centre.

Vehicular Circulation within the Fort

- 7.3 Vehicular access within Fort St. Elmo and its outerworks will be generally excluded except for service and temporary loading / unloading requirements. Special provision should also be made for emergency situations for the access of fire-engines and ambulances to any part of the complex. The main justifications for excluding vehicular traffic would be to render the historic environment more pleasant and safer to visitors and to limit the detrimental effects caused by vehicular pollution to the physical fabric of the Fort.

Provision for Parking

- 7.4 A Traffic Impact Statement for the proposed range and scale of uses will establish the appropriate number of car parking spaces required to support the projects, within the context of a holistic transport strategy for Valletta. A potential location for an underground car park is the Evans Building site, provided the Conservation Management Plan considers positively the redevelopment of this building and provision of underground development.
- 7.5 Any other arrangements which will alleviate the demand for parking will be seriously considered. The present public bus service around the Valletta ring-road could be further improved by more frequent trips to service the Fort complex. A dedicated service from the Park and Ride Scheme to the lower section of Valletta could be considered.

Service Traffic

- 7.6 In projects of such a scale, a certain degree of service traffic is unavoidable. Transportation requirements for the commercial and cultural facilities will be

accommodated by a strictly regulated access to the Carafa Enceinte and the parade ground in the Carafa Esplanade. Vehicular access will be restricted within specific periods of time preferably at off-peak hours.

- 7.7 Provisions will be made for special arrangements for the collection of refuse which will be disposed of at one collecting point. The centralisation of all refuse generated within the Fort complex would contribute to the reduction of internal vehicular traffic. An appropriate place for the collection of refuse should be included in any proposed redevelopment project. Such a location should be preferably located within close proximity to access roads although it should not be visually conspicuous. The Utilities Plan will address this issue in more detail.

8.0 Utilities

Existing Infrastructure and Services

- 8.1 Presently, the Fort complex and its environs are serviced by the basic infrastructure existing in Valletta. The operational facilities are connected to the public water, electricity and sewage infrastructure. Due to the current low utilisation of the Fort complex, the load on the service infrastructure can be considered to be nominal. There is presently no provision for the storage of surface water run-off.
- 8.2 The Evans Building is fully integrated within Valletta's service infrastructure as the building presently accommodates several offices.
- 8.3 Further work is required to determine in detail the existing capacities of the various utilities namely electricity, water supply and drainage services. All services are to be integrated within the design and no services are to be left exposed.

Upgrading of Service Infrastructure

- 8.4 The implementation of the projects would entail the overhaul and extensive upgrading of the service infrastructure. This is particularly the case for the provision of sewage and solid waste disposal and the installation of the appropriate network for telecommunications.
- 8.5 At this preliminary stage it is not possible to predict with a reasonable degree of accuracy the requirements both in terms of the upgrading of the basic services infrastructure and the introduction of any telecommunications and informational technology systems.
- 8.6 At a later stage of the development process, more technical data and projections will have to be provided after specific studies prepared by specialist experts in the various utilities required. It is envisaged that the following aspects of the service infrastructure would need to be the subject of further detailed studies:
- (i) Water supply and storage of water surface run-off
 - (ii) Electricity generation
 - (iii) Solid waste disposal
 - (iv) Public sewage
 - (v) Telecommunications

Special Considerations

- 8.7 Special consideration should be given to the impact that the upgrading of the service infrastructure would have on the historic fabric and the surrounding environment. Some of these considerations would include:
- (i) All overhead cables and wires are to be preferably buried underground so as not to detract from the visual quality of the urban environment.
 - (ii) The storage and disposal of solid waste in a suitable site so as not to have a negative impact on the local environment.
 - (iii) Ensuring that any service equipment does not adversely affect the skyline of the historical urban environment of Valletta.

Energy Considerations

- 8.8 Efforts should be made to incorporate the latest energy saving technology in the proposed development, especially in the new-build elements of the projects. Wherever possible natural lighting and ventilation should be provided so as to reduce artificial lighting and air-conditioning which consume large quantities of energy.
- 8.9 The architectural design, of the various building components and the type of building materials to be utilised will all have to be carefully considered in relation to energy saving policies.
- 8.10 As far as practicable, the rehabilitation of historic structures will seek to incorporate measures to reduce energy consumption, although these must not compromise the historic value of the building nor should they be visually intrusive.
- 8.11 Although the potential for onsite renewable energy generation is limited there may still be scope for visually unobtrusive photovoltaic panels particularly on the Evans Building and the Examination Centre. Micro wind turbines are not considered as suitable energy generation technology for this area.

9.0 Submission Requirements

- 9.1 It is envisaged that full development permits for different parts of the site may be issued following the submission of the following information which cover the whole development brief area except for any of the restoration elements on any part of the Development Brief Area and the uses of Fort St. Elmo and the Carafa Enceinte:
- Project Description Statement;
 - Conservation Management Plan;
 - Restoration Method Statement
 - Traffic Impact Statement;
 - Construction Management Plan;
 - Environmental Management Plan;
 - Utilities Plan
- 9.2 The **Project Description Statement** (PDS) shall be a concise written general statement giving a clear description of the development concept, including a comprehensive schedule of land use/space provisions, the mix of uses, construction and operation employment levels by category, and how it complies with the requirements in the Development Brief and other relevant planning policies, together with a description of each facility of the project and a schedule of all space allocations (in square metres). This would enable the screening of the projects in accordance with the Environmental Impact Assessment Regulations of 2007 (LN 114/07).
- 9.3 The **Conservation Management Plan** is to include for each building, structure and open space:
- (i) Researched architectural, historical, social background;
 - (ii) Identification of current state of the fabric;
 - (iii) Assessment of significance.
- 9.4 The **Restoration Method Statement** is to include for each building, structure and open space:
- (i) Interventions required for conservation,
 - (ii) Techniques and methods for conservation.
- 9.5 The **Traffic Impact Statement** (TIS) will be prepared in accordance with the relevant terms of reference provided by Transport Malta.
- 9.6 The **Construction Management Plan** is to include details of:
- (i) Any site excavations and the sites for construction, recycling and waste disposal;
 - (ii) The siting and works required for utility provisions;
 - (iii) Temporary access roads, all construction access points and proposals for maintaining pedestrian and vehicular access;
 - (iv) Underground structures, storage areas for plant and materials, location of any cranes used in construction;
 - (v) Phasing of all of the above with consideration being given to the tourism peak months.

- 9.7 The **Environmental Management Plan** (EMP) should detail the proposals for energy saving and efficiency. The EMP is to include efficient use of resources including energy and water, environmentally sensitive construction methods and waste management.
- 9.8 The **Utilities Plan** should predict the requirements of water, electricity, communications and sewerage systems and the likely impact on the existing networks, the location of proposed site utilities including connection to the existing public networks (Scale 1:1000), and proof of negotiations with the relevant utilities organisations.
- 9.9 The development applications should be supported by:
- Existing site survey with indicated levels. Scale 1:500.
 - Proposed site layout, including any new site levels and all proposed land uses. Scale 1:500.
 - Composite overall scheme plans showing levels, building, landscaping, vehicle parking facilities, utilities, servicing arrangements and the proposed phasing and construction space requirements. Scale 1:1000.
 - Plans, elevations and sections of the proposed new buildings and those structures to be rehabilitated. Scale 1:200.
 - Detailed proposals for landscaping and maintenance, including incorporation of existing trees (which should be distinguishable from proposed planting), new planting (with species and number), hard landscaping, street furniture and lighting. Scale 1:200.
 - Schedule of materials, colours and textures of all external finishes and hard landscaping works, and how these will be employed.
 - Schedule of floor space by type of land use.
 - Photomontages to be taken from different points on higher ground in the vicinity of the site. The exact points are to be determined in consultation with MEPA. The photos are to be taken through a normal lens subtending a field of view of around 45 degrees. Moreover, they should be presented on A3 sized prints.
 - The developer will also need to be in possession of a design criteria compliance certificate from MTA for tourism related development, before a permit is issued by MEPA.

APPENDICES

Appendix A: Policy Context

Structure Plan Context

The Structure Plan is the main policy statement to any major development on the Maltese Islands. The plan acknowledges the special status and role of Valletta, not only as a World Heritage Site but as Malta's traditional centre of authority and public administration, and a primary centre for shopping, offices, and cultural activities (refer to S.P., 3.24, p.12).

i) (S.P., UCO 3, p.87) Fort St. Elmo lies within the confines of the Valletta Harbours Heritage Conservation and Improvement Area defined as

'The area between the ridge containing the Cottonera Lines, the Sliema ridge, and extending beyond the landward ends of Grand harbour and Marsamxett harbour'

ii) With reference to Fig. 15.1 of the Explanatory memorandum, Fort St. Elmo is identified as one of the 'Development Opportunities Within the Context of a Conservation Framework'.

Valletta - Urban Regeneration Context

The population of Valletta has been steadily declining. This demographic decline has been consistent and shows no signs of abating due to several reasons which would include the following:

- i) The loss of prime residential property in the central part of Valletta which was converted into administrative offices and commercial retail outlets;
- ii) Problems with vehicular accessibility and the acute shortage of parking;
- iii) The substandard condition of tenements in the residential area within the lower part of Valletta.

The proposed rehabilitation of Fort St. Elmo and its environs would contribute to the abatement of some of these problems and would be crucial to the urban renewal and regeneration of the lower end of Valletta.

Considerable potential exists for the rehabilitation of both the historical Fort complex and the adjacent sites of the Evans' Laboratories and Examination Centre block.

(S.P., UCO 12:1, p.89) 'There will be a continuing commitment to the enhancement of Conservation Areas, listed buildings, and structures of outstanding architectural or historical interest, by means of promoting restoration, good street furniture design, landscaping, and finding new uses for vacant and underused buildings. Where appropriate grants will be made available to carry out this enhancement work through a Land Tribunal and Trust'

The rehabilitation and redevelopment of the Fort St. Elmo complex would serve to attract more locals and tourists to go beyond the central urban core of Valletta. Presently, Fort St. Elmo is grossly under-utilised as the quarters of the Police Academy. The Fort is ill-suited for its present use, the need for modern facilities and extensive open spaces for the Police Academy are incompatible with the Fort's historic context.

There exists the potential to create public open spaces and to establish a heritage trail along the Fort's bastions which would contribute to a better appreciation of Valletta's historic heritage and to enhance the public environment of the capital city.

Valletta - Tourism Issues

Any proposed project for the restoration and rehabilitation of Fort St. Elmo should be aimed at tapping the full potential of this strategic historic site to attract tourists and local visitors to the southern end of Valletta. Tourism-generated revenue would contribute to a better quality of life within the lower income residential neighbourhoods.

The proposed redevelopment project would have to be compatible with the following tourism policies as stated in the Structure Plan document:

i) (S.P., TOU 11, p. 64) 'Government will seek the co-operation of relevant public and private sector agencies to ensure that the Islands' many heritage items are made more accessible to tourists. Heritage trails will be identified in Local Plans.'

ii) (S.P., TOU 8, p.63) The Planning Authority will give favourable consideration to tourist and recreation related facilities on the waterfront of Marsamxett Harbour. Development will include the removal of the existing clutter of small buildings at the base of the Valletta/Floriana fortifications, so as to portray the fortifications to their best advantage.'

iii) (S.P., TOU 9, p. 63) 'In Urban Conservation Areas, the Authority will particularly encourage tourist development in the form of conversion, extension and refurbishment of existing buildings and facilities as long as the proposed development does not infringe the provision of Policies CON 6, 7 and 8.'

Valletta - Office Accommodation

Presently there is a high concentration of public and private sector office facilities in Valletta and Floriana.

(S.P., COM 2, p.41) 'Development of Private Sector Offices, by either conversion or new building, will not normally be permitted in Valletta/Floriana; unless and until suitable transport access, vehicle parking and pedestrian circulation for Valletta/Floriana as a whole are secured.'

Grand Harbour Local Plan 2010

The main elements of the GHP strategy in respect of Valletta are:

- To strengthen the role of the City as the national capital;
- To encourage economic growth and regeneration;
- To seek environmental improvement.

This will be achieved through:

- improving access to the city, minimise the growth of traffic flow and improve facilities for the pedestrians;
- expand the attractions of the city to enliven the capital particularly in the evenings;
- strengthen the residential use by encouraging the rehabilitation of older buildings, introduction of resident parking schemes, and limit office expansion into residential blocks;
- strengthening the role as a primary town centre by upgrading the overall quality of the shopping experience;
- optimising the tourism potential by the provision of additional tourist attractions particularly by the re-use of historical buildings;
- conservation and restoration of the positive features of Valletta.

GV 12 – Car parking

The policy prohibits the provision of new public car parking except for operational parking.

GV 19 – Town Centre

The policy designates the primary town centre of Valletta and identifies the primary and secondary retail frontages within the town centre. The aim of the policy is to retain and reinforce the primary shopping zone.

GV 24 – Office Development

The policy allows new office development when the proposed office involves the conservation, through adequate rehabilitation and reuse of a historic building already scheduled as Grade 1 and 2 or buildings that merit scheduling.

GV 26 – Sites for redevelopment

The policy identifies Fort St. Elmo and Evans Building as sites where the initiation of redevelopment is encouraged.

GV 27 – Fort St. Elmo and Evans Buildings

The policy requires the preparation and approval of a development brief for the two sites. The brief is to give guidance on the appropriate land-uses, design, access, parking, servicing and planning gain in form of restoration and public open space. Uses that would be favourably considered are cultural, tourism and educational, while other uses such as offices (including software development) residential and retail (specialised shopping) will need to be assessed in relation to other policies in the plan.

GE 01 – Valleys, Areas of Ecological Importance / Geological Importance and Site of

Scientific Importance Policy applies for the foreshore around the Fort complex. The policy prohibits any development which would prejudice the unique character of the areas or adversely affect individual sites.

Appendix B – Photos of Site

Identity Area 1 - Fort St. Elmo



Image 1: Porta Principale to Fort St. Elmo



Image 2: View of Fort St. Elmo from the Granaries



Image 3: Barrack building within Fort St. Elmo

Identity Area 2 – Carafa Esplande



Image 4: War Museum



Image 5: Pinto Stores



Image 6: Roof of bomb-proof Vendome water tank structures



Image 7: Vendome water fountain with accompanying Doric colonnade



Image 8: Officers' Quarters Ruins

Identity Area 3 – Carafa Enceinte



Image 9: The Malta Experience building

Identity Area 4 – The landfront Ditch of Fort St. Elmo



Image 10: Ditch

Identify Area 5 – The Evans Building



Image 11: Evans Building elevation from Triq il-Mediterran



Image 12: Evans Building elevation from Triq il-Merkanti



Image 13: Nibbia Chapel Remains scheduled as Class B ruins

Identity Area 6- The Examination Centre



Image 14: Examination Centre front elevation



Image 15: Examination Centre elevation overlooking Misrah Sant' Iermu



Image 16: Examination Centre elevation from Triq il-Merkanti

Identity Area 7 – The Pedestrian Precinct



Image 17: The Granaries in front of Fort St. Elmo



Image 18: Road leading to Triq il-Mediterran

Identity Area 8 – The Foreshore



Image 19: St. Lazarus and Abercrombie Curtain Walls along foreshore



Image 20: Abercrombie Curtain



Image 21: Breakwater



Image 22: Sir Alexander Ball Curtain



Image 23: St. Gregory Curtain

Appendix C: Public Submissions with MEPA Responses

Public Submissions on Draft DB with MEPA Responses

Ref	Respondent	Date	Summary of Comments Received	MEPA Response
SEB/1	Ms. Gaby Galea Lauri	08/02/2011	Agrees with the proposals in the Brief. Renovated castles, forts, convents monasteries etc for tourism accommodation purposes can be found in Turkey and Portugal.	Comment noted.
SEB/2	Mr. George Swindellis Malta Photographic Society	08/02/2011	The Malta Photographic Society would like to register their interest in discussing relocation of their premises to the development brief area as their present accommodation is much undersized. Apart from meetings, the society holds a successful school at their premises. Works of members could be exhibited on site as part of a Visitor Attraction. The society is looking to develop photography as a niche tourism market.	Establishment of new exhibition space, cultural uses and education facilities are supported by the Development Brief. However it is not MEPA's remit to determine which societies are to be located within the Fort.
SEB/3	Dr. Philip Agius Touring Club Malta	09/02/2011	Fort St. Elmo should be a cultural centre that can also house the Malta Transport Museum which would contain the old vintage buses and other items related to transport. This museum can be incorporated with the War Museum similar to the ones in Switzerland, London, Coventry, etc. The new public transport operator said on local media that they would be helping in the setting up of this museum.	The use of Fort St. Elmo for cultural, educational and tourism related facilities are supported by the Development Brief. However it is not MEPA's remit to determine which museums are to be located within the Fort.

			<p>On site there could also be a conference hall and the house of the Maltese Drivers' Club, the Maltese Motoring Heritage and the Touring Club Malta.</p> <p>A house for the elderly of Valletta should also be located within the Brief area.</p> <p>The AFM should also have a base in the Fort as they are part of the history of Malta. The AFM or other Military Organisations may co-operate in the running of the site.</p>	<p>The Development Brief area is not ideal for locating a home for the elderly as such use is not compatible with the objectives of creating a cultural hub supported by a commercial quarter within the Fort. The only part of the Brief Area which could potentially be considered for an elderly home is the Evans Building site but this use is not considered appropriate in the view of proposed mix of uses in the area.</p> <p>It is not MEPA's remit to determine which agencies or organisations occupy the Fort. The continued military use of the historic fort as a primary function is not considered in line with the objective of diversifying the use into more culturally oriented uses.</p>
SEB/4	Mr. Lars Vangdal Tveisme	15/02/2011	Supports the proposals in the brief as it will make tourist visits to Malta more interesting.	Comment noted.
SEB/5	Mr. G.J Wirth Honorary Consulate for Malta. Nasau – Bahamas	15/02/2011	To maximise and improve the business of the Conference Centre a specifically designed Conference-Convention Hotel in Fort St. Elmo would be commendable. The Conference Centre urgently needs vehicular parking space if possible underground. Parts of the Fort for should be used for upscale restaurant	The use of Fort St. Elmo for cultural facilities, tourism accommodation and commercial facilities including restaurants are supported by the Development Brief. A Traffic Impact Assessment, in conjunction with a Conservation Management Plan, will consider the appropriate number of car parking

			<p>development – souvenir retail.</p> <p>The bulkhead below the Fort could be developed as a new Cruise Dock with vertical elevator (s) which could transport the cruise visitors directly to the Fort and Conference Center.</p> <p>Establish ferry locations on either side of the peninsula to allow residents to take the ferry across the harbour. This should be linked to transport connections to the City Center.</p> <p>The road width should be increased.</p> <p>The War Museum should be retained.</p> <p>A high priority should be given to the landscaping of open areas especially those</p>	<p>spaces. This is one of the submission requirements for any eventual development proposals.</p> <p>A cruise passenger terminal beneath Fort St. Elmo is beyond the remit of the Brief as it involves decision at a more strategic level regarding the future uses in the Port and their potential location.</p> <p>In view of the exposed nature of the site, it is not advisable that a ferry facility be provided immediately along the foreshore of the Fort. However, there may be direct transport services to the Fort complex from a more sheltered ferry terminal.</p> <p>The Brief considers the design of the existing road to have a negative effect on the planned visitor attraction and hence is that measures are taken to make this road more pedestrian friendly. The impact of this proposal on the traffic flow along this stretch of road and the wider traffic circulation routes in Valletta will be studied as part of the TIS.</p> <p>There are no proposals to remove the War Museum from the site.</p> <p>The Development Brief includes guidance for landscaping within specific areas.</p>
--	--	--	--	--

			spaces having views over the Grand Harbour.	
SEB/6	Iwona Osmolska	14/02/2010	Request for information.	Replied to on 16/02/2011
SEB/7	Dr. John A. Consiglio	23/02/2011	<p>Any works that are planned to be carried out on Fort St. Elmo that do not recognise the essential history of the place will detract from the Fort. This applies to the totality of the Fort....no purely academic distinguishing between Upper and Lower Elmo please.</p> <p>Any decisions on planning and/or eventual works should be taken in consultation with people who have either studied the purely military connotations of the place, and, more important, who have indeed lived and worked there as military personnel.</p> <p>Fort St. Elmo is presently Malta Government property and absolutely no part of it should ever be allowed to be given, by whatever legal title to purely speculative proponents, including hotel owners or operators, or purely commercial other similar operators.</p> <p>Fort Saint. Elmo can and must be restored to accommodate:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Improved facilities for the Malta Police Academy, - The Malta Armed Forces Band or other 	<p>Planning proposals for a historic complex of the scale of Fort St. Elmo need to ensure that while the cultural value is not undermined a viable scheme is brought forward. The history of the Fort reveals that there is a clear distinction between the Upper Fort and the Lower Fort both in terms of construction and functionality.</p> <p>The MEPA heritage body (CHAC) and the SCH have been consulted in the formulation of this Brief. The general public was also consulted twice and anyone was free to make their submissions, as indeed some did, for consideration.</p> <p>MEPA will not be involved in the implementation of the proposals and it is up to the implementing agency to determine the financing of the significant expense required to conserve the Fort.</p> <p>The future uses within the Fort and its surroundings should support the objective of converting the area into a cultural and commercial hub which will restore and conserve the historic fabric while injecting</p>

			<p>AFM Units e.g. the Bomb Disposal Squadron,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Rooms for ex-servicemen's Associations which exist on the island, e.g. the RMA Association, the KOMR Association, the British Legion, the RAF Association, the RN Association, the 3/11 Regiment RMA(T) Association, and similar others. - The Valletta Group of the Scouts Association. - A proper military history museum, cum classes for formal academic courses in this subject. - Proper restoration, and use, of the Chapel therein. - A small cinema where presentations similar to the Malta Experience can be located for tourists. - A proper walking route for tourists which covers the whole of the Fort's ramparts and parts including appropriate interpretation of the Fort and seating areas. - A proper Guard Room at the entrance of the Fort, this to include a daily formal Guard Change ceremony. These soldiers should also be responsible of conducting visitor/tourist group walks around the whole of the Fort. - A small but smart Souvenirs Shop. - A small but smart Coffee Shop (but no formal restaurant or bar facilities). - Accommodation, within the Fort of a 	<p>new economic activities in the lower part of Valletta. The use of Fort St. Elmo for cultural activities with ancillary facilities, educational purposes, offices and recreation uses are supported by the DB. However, it is not MEPA's remit to allocate the sites within the area to specific users.</p>
--	--	--	---	---

			<p>Centre for Peace Studies, or such similar academic institution. Efforts should be made to find out whether, e.g. some reputable foreign university or academic body would be prepared to use part of the Fort for its own programme of Mediterranean Studies.</p> <p>Tourism accommodation should only be accommodated within the Evans Building but not within the Fort.</p> <p>The parade grounds within the Lower Fort area should not be linked to tourism accommodation but must return to be used for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Training by the AFM of its recruit groups - Regular re-enactments, - Tattoo events, - Drama or artistic events. <p>EU funding should be sought and obtained for the project, but only if the above matters/suggestions are given paramount importance.</p> <p>The Edinburgh Castle in Scotland is a good example of sensible conservation and profitable usage of an edifice that is essentially and historically military in its core character.</p>	<p>Tourism accommodation will attract more permanent visitors to the site and raise its profile as a visitor attraction. Tourism development also has the financial potential to restore the existing historic buildings.</p> <p>Training by the AFM of its recruits is considered incompatible with the objective of creating a publicly accessible open space at the parade grounds in the Lower Fort. The other activities are encouraged by the Brief but these are more related to the day to day management of the space.</p> <p>The issue of EU funding will need to be considered by the agency responsible for the implementation of the project.</p> <p>Comment noted.</p>
--	--	--	--	--

SEB/8	Kevin Casha	23/02/2011	The Malta Institute of Professional Photography (MIPP) wants to establish, a centre within the Fort where photographic organizations can hold their meetings, seminars etc. The place could also serve as a photography gallery as well as a museum.	The use of Fort St. Elmo for cultural, educational and tourism related facilities are supported by the Development Brief. However it is not MEPA's remit to determine the users of the Fort.
SEB/9	Mr. Matthew Paris Aequitas Legal	25/02/2011	<p>For the purpose of this submission Fort St. Elmo (FSE) refers to the original Fort, the Carafa Enceinte, the Carafa Esplanade, the landfront ditch and the granaries.</p> <p>The area should be mutated into a:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • centre of excellence for educational services; and • high-end residential hotspot; and • a cradle for commercial activity (including but not limited to Bars, Restaurants etc...); and • state-of-the-art office amenity space; and • touristic attraction through the installation of museums and visual 3-d animations. <p>This will ensure that FSE is restored and will thus be an important project to enhance and</p>	<p>The Brief proposes a broad range of uses for distinct areas – cultural (museums) for Fort St. Elmo, predominantly commercial (retail, offices, tourism accomodation) for the Carafa Esplanade and a heritage trail to link the area together. The determination of which use is most appropriate for each building will depend on various issues including financial feasibility, environmental and heritage impacts. The provision of this mix of facilities will assist in creating a dynamic pole within the lower end of Valletta which would attract both local visitors as well as tourists.</p> <p>Locating residential uses within the Fort St. Elmo Complex is not considered favourably as the main objective of the Brief is to create a cultural and tourism attraction with supporting amenities to attract visitors and economic activity to the area rather limiting public access to the area by developing another residential hub.</p> <p>The Conservation Management Plan will determine which are the structures that are</p>

			stimulate economic activity and address the social needs of the country. These proposed activities will ensure that the area is made use of 24/7 as it will attract a large number of commuters. However, this should not be done through the jeopardizing of the historic value of the site. The ubiquitous identity of the monumental buildings comprising the site should be retained, whereas ill-constructed structures developed later in-time should be demolished.	not of conservation value and hence can be demolished.
SEB/10	Dr. Joseph Buhagiar Dept. Biology University of Malta, Director Argotti Botanical Gardens Floriana	02/03/2011	The ditch of Fort St. Elmo never hosted a botanical garden. The medicinal plants grown for the Sacra Infermeria (and not for the school of Anatomy of the order) formed part of a Physic garden.	Development Brief has been amended accordingly.
SEB/11	Mr. Peter Fenech Chairman Mediterranean Conference Centre (MCC)	17/03/2011	<p>The MCC, Evans laboratories and the tourism's walking trade have brought more visitors to the area. This part of Valletta has become a vibrant commercial area. This has had the consequence of an increased volume of road traffic. The city gate development will render further the need to use Valletta's ring road and it must be ensured that there is as little parking as possible in potential bottlenecks.</p> <p>The lower part of Valletta particularly the MCC lacks adequate parking facilities which has in turn hampered MCC's commercial operations, dampened tourism experience of the area and strained relations between</p>	<p>The detailed traffic management in the area between the MCC up to Spur Street shall be addressed within the TIS.</p> <p>The parking problems in Valletta cannot be addressed in a piecemeal manner through specific interventions such as increase in parking provision but need to be addressed as part of a wide range of measures including</p>

			<p>residents.</p> <p>This area is crying for adequate parking facilities and no further development in Valletta can be justified without such amenities. Whilst MEPA permits allow developers to purchase on street in lieu of their parking facilities, down in lower Valletta this is not recommendable and feasible.</p> <p>MCC strongly supports the idea of providing parking facilities on the site of the Evans Building and urges Government to take the correct political and commercial decision by designating an underground car park on the Evans Building Site. Overlying the car park, which MCC is interested in managing, should be a boutique hotel. Such a development would render the area complete. MCC is also in favour of to the space in front of the electoral office being converted to an open space. Facilities provided on the Evans Building site should not provide facilities that compete with those provided by MCC.</p> <p>MCC believes that no conservation management plan can justify ruining the possibility of easing the traffic generation more so once the project for Fort St. Elmo is completed.</p>	<p>other modes of transport besides the private car.</p> <p>Tourism accommodation is one of the uses being recommended for the reuse of the Evans Building. However, it is not MEPA's remit to determine the operator of such a facility.</p> <p>MEPA has retained its position about the future of the Evans Building i.e. the Conservation Management Plan will determine the retention or redevelopment of the building and the potential for underground parking facilities.</p>
--	--	--	---	--

			MCC reiterates its desire to form part of every eventual decision affecting its environs and more importantly requests that it becomes possessor of the proposed underground car park and environs. This would ensure that its operations complement that of the MCC.	The allocation of the individual sites within the Development Brief area is not MEPA's remit.
SEB/12	Din I-Art Helwa (DLH)	18/03/2011	<p>DLH supports the principles of the development brief but recommends that a more in depth study of its historic fabric be made and detailed feasibility studies be drawn up before decisions on allotment of its assets be taken.</p> <p>The organization recommends that the upgrading of the Sacra Infermeria should form part of the Brief area and the new uses planned in Fort St Elmo should be coordinated and be sympathetic with those at the MCC.</p> <p>It remains imperative that uniformity and simplicity are requested from its occupiers for the materials and style chosen when planning conversions, interiors, services and signage. The overall effect must enhance the Fort's austere, military features and not dominate them.</p>	<p>The studies, including the conservation appraisal, should be done by the applicant as the economic feasibility needs to be brought into the equation. The economically feasible land use can then be assessed for its impacts on the conservation value of the site.</p> <p>The use of the Malta Conference Centre has been established for a number of years. The range of uses being proposed for the Fort St. Elmo and environs are deemed to be compatible with those at MCC. The Brief does not preclude the upgrading of the Sacra Infermeria but its inclusion within the Development Brief area would burden the implementation of both projects unnecessarily.</p> <p>MEPA agrees with this comment and has updated the development brief to include these recommendations.</p>

			<p>To this end DLH suggests that the fort's assets are not contracted out in an ad hoc fashion, but that the overall plan be established before allotments start to be made.</p> <p>DLH is in favour of</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Giving Heritage Malta a wider scope for its current war museum • Use of spaces for educational purposes with sensitively planned accommodation, language schools • Indoor sports and recreational facilities and gym • Retaining the Evans building, with better use being made of its internal spaces. • Revealing the original ditch in front of the Fort • Rerouting of traffic to allow a pedestrianised zone in front of the Fort and granaries. • The creation of a safe bathing area on the foreshore near the Abercrombie Curtain • Any conversion of the Examinations building should be sensitive to its historic value; it should not be seen as a development opportunity. • Consider the demolition of the Officers Quarters. <p>Din I-Art Helwa is opposed to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public buildings being sold or leased on excessively long leases 	<p>MEPA agrees with this comment provided it does not unnecessarily hinder the expeditious implementation of the restoration project of the Fort.</p> <p>The use of Fort St. Elmo Complex for cultural uses is supported by the Development Brief. However it is not MEPA's remit to determine which museums are to be located within the Fort. The use of Fort St. Elmo Complex for educational facilities is supported by the Development Brief. The DB is indicating tourism accommodation as one of the potential uses. The Conservation Management Plan will determine retention or otherwise of the Evans building, Officers Quarters and the scale of interventions on the Examination Centre. Should retention of the Evans Building and the Officers Quarters be recommended the plan will also need to identify the interventions that can be undertaken. The creation of a bathing area may conflict with the port function of the Grand Harbour.</p> <p>The sale/lease of land is not MEPA's remit. Residential use is restricted solely to the Evans</p>
--	--	--	--	---

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The creation of new residential spaces • The rebuilding of a replica lighthouse • The introduction of new architecture into the Fort. 	<p>Building and as a possible use from a range of uses. Increasing the availability of new housing in Valletta is still a worthy objective albeit of secondary importance. The lighthouse has considerable historic connotation with the Fort and the port. MEPA sees no harm in re-introducing this landmark. When done sensitively, new architecture can actually add to the historic interest of the site and symbolize its continuous evolution.</p>
SEB/13	Mr. John Attard Kingswell (Director Environmental Health) for Director General (Public Health Regulation Department)	21/03/2011	<p>The ground floor of the Evans Building houses the Public Health Laboratory (Microbiological and Chemical sections). In 1996, a decision was taken to refurbish the Public Health Laboratory (PHL) and to upgrade its facilities to E.U. requirements. This included extensive investment by the Maltese Government and additional funding through a twinning programme and Transition Facility National Programme of the European Union.</p> <p>It is not simply a question of identifying an alternative site and transferring the testing facilities. Some of the equipment and systems are simply not-transferrable whilst other equipment needs months to set and calibration before it can be used again. There is a high risk of irreparable damage to the equipment. Furthermore the accreditation status will be at least temporarily suspended.</p> <p>For these reasons the Directorate is compelled</p>	<p>The Development Brief proposes a range of uses for the Evans Building. It will be up to the implementing agency to determine which use is the most suited for this site and retention of the current use as Laboratory and offices may be deemed the most appropriate in the circumstances.</p>

			<p>to object to any development which would force the eviction of the Public Health Laboratory.</p> <p>If this development is deemed to be indispensable, it is recommended that the developer will be required to finance an alternative site, expenses for re-location and expenses for the contracting of another laboratory (foreign) to perform the analysis currently performed at the Public Health Laboratory.</p>	
SEB/14	Ms. Astrid Vella Coordinator Flimkien ghal Ambjent Ahjar (FAA)	21/03/2011	<p>FAA notes that the Development Brief includes the entire Fort in a holistic project, a fact that FAA believes is essential to the success of the project.</p> <p>Fort St. Elmo and World War II Museum – FAA encourages innovative ideas to create a heritage attraction that will have a real potential to draw additional visitors to our islands. An insensitive interpretation of plans such as those for the Carafa Esplanade, tourist accommodation, food and beverage outlets, retail outlets, office accommodation and educational purposes' could turn our premier heritage monument into a commercial enterprise, reducing it to a crowded 'theme park museum'. The FAA's explains in detail its ideas for A 'Mediterranean War Museum' or a 'War at</p>	<p>MEPA agrees that there are benefits to be gained from the comprehensive planning of the site provided it does not unnecessarily hinder the expeditious implementation of the restoration project of the Fort.</p> <p>The re-use of Fort St. Elmo for cultural activities including museums is fully supported by the Development Brief however it is not MEPA's remit to determine which museums are located within the Brief area. Planning proposals for a historic complex of the scale of Fort St. Elmo need to ensure that while the cultural value is not undermined a viable scheme is brought forward. With this regard, the Development Brief aims at generating a mix of uses i.e. cultural, recreational and commercial activity.</p>

			<p>Sea' museum and other museums such as for contemporary art, costumes, industry which have potential to act as an international cultural draw while respecting the Fort's historic value. This project could be combined with a heritage trail through Valletta.</p> <p>The proposal to convert of St. Elmo or the examination centre for cultural purposes is to be applauded.</p> <p>Pinto Stores – The brief has suggested possible uses for these sites including tourist accommodation. It is difficult to envisage a hotel within the Pinto Stores being able to offer the level of comfort demanded by today's tourist without significant additional construction which would be incompatible with St. Elmo's Scheduled Grade 1 status. For this reasons this project requires an EIA according to Malta's Environmental Impact Assessment Regulations of 2007. It is also questionable whether a hotel within the St Elmo complex would have the same allure that a purpose-built, upmarket hotel on the more accessible Evans Building site would have.</p> <p>The Pinto Magazines could be converted into workshops for Maltese traditional crafts like lace, weaving, and filigree.</p> <p>While FAA recognises the need for museum</p>	<p>Tourism accommodation in Pinto Stores is one of the potential commercial uses amongst other uses that include cultural and educational. The studies, including the EIA, shall be done by the applicant in order to determine the scale and range of uses. The economic feasibility for each part of the site also needs to be brought into the equation. The economically feasible land uses can then be assessed for its impacts on the conservation value of the site.</p> <p>These small scale traditional activities are supported by the DB for the Carafa Esplanade.</p>
--	--	--	--	---

			<p>souvenir shops, the Development Brief's proposal to set up more shops, possibly unrelated to the cultural heritage theme of Fort St Elmo and Pinto Magazines, could harm the existing shops in Valletta. Similarly, while a museum cafeteria and some restaurant facilities are a required, the proliferation of several restaurants on this site could compete with already existing amenities in Valletta. FAA therefore emphasises that any decision on the amount of space to be dedicated to shops and restaurants should only be taken after professional studies are carried out to analyse their location on Valletta's periphery will have on existing outlets within Valletta's centre, another issue to be examined in the required EIA.</p> <p>Evans Building and Urban Regeneration – FAA cannot support the proposal to construct upmarket residential units or offices on the site of the Evans' Laboratories complex. In previous plans announced to the public, this site had been earmarked for a 4-5 star hotel which would attract cultural tourists to enjoy the artistic activities at St. Elmo and its environs.</p> <p><u>Offices:</u> The provision of office space in a new building on the Evans Laboratories site would violate existing planning regulations. (Structure Plan Policy COM 2 and GHLP Policy GV 24).</p>	<p>The Development Brief has limited commercial uses to the Carafa Esplanade and the Evans Building. This will assist, together with the cultural and tourism uses in creating a dynamic pole within the lower end of Valletta which would attract both local visitors as well as tourists. Impact assessment studies are still a requirement of the Brief.</p> <p>Tourism accommodation is one of the uses that are being proposed for the Evans Building. Offices already exist on site and Increasing the availability of new housing in Valletta is still a worthy objective albeit of secondary importance. The developer would need to determine the most economically feasible land use within this range subject to an EIA.</p> <p>Offices already exist on site.</p>
--	--	--	--	---

			<p><u>Residential Units:</u> The construction of residential units to replace the Evans Laboratory building is poor planning practice and is also unacceptable to use public property for a purely speculative project which does not benefits the residents of the area.</p> <p><u>Hotel:</u> The building of a hotel or apartments at the Evans Laboratories site would not necessarily provide employment during the construction stage as contractors would bring in labour from outside the area. However, unlike apartments, a hotel would generate a large number of long-term employment opportunities for locals.</p> <p>Housing and Social Issues FAA would be against any enclave of upmarket apartments in an area characterised by sub-standard housing which would not only go against any morals of social solidarity but it would also highlight the culture of a two tier society – those who can afford luxury apartments and those who cannot.</p> <p>Other - FAA is highly appreciative of the fact that the</p>	<p>The enlargement of the Development Brief area to include surrounding residential areas and include their rehabilitation as part of the scheme may burden the project unnecessarily and threaten its viability. The development of new residential units on the Evans Building site could serve as a catalyst for the take up of vacant property within the surrounding area following from the regeneration of the area.</p> <p>The planning process cannot ensure that jobs would be taken up by residents of the surrounding area.</p> <p>The development Brief does not stipulate that the housing units have to be upmarket. The development of a mix of residential units may actually attract first-time buyers. The DB sees the rehabilitation and regeneration of the Fort St. Elmo and environs as a catalyst that would attract further opportunities for the rehabilitation and re-use of vacant residential buildings.</p>
--	--	--	--	---

			<p>Botanic Gardens in the Landfront Ditch, the Vendome water tank and fountain, the Doric colonnade and arcaded structures on the Abercrombie Bastion as well as anti-aircraft pill-boxes, concrete gun emplacements and related structures are to be restored.</p> <p>Concluding remarks – FAA hopes that the competent authorities including MTA, Heritage Malta, VRP and other important stakeholders will be invited to cooperate in order to create a well-studied and ambitious project which presents our history in an original way. The success of such a project also depends on its holistic integration with a heritage trail, attractive hotel accommodation and the upgrading of the whole area.</p>	<p>Comment noted.</p> <p>The implementation of the projects and the involvement of other entities at this stage is the responsibility of the implementing agency.</p>
SEB/15	Ms. Davinia Galea Executive Director The Malta Council for Culture and the Arts (MCCA)	22/03/2011	<p>The MCCA concurs with the Fort St Elmo Development Brief in that the site should be dedicated to cultural activity. The MCCA adds that this regeneration project of national and world heritage importance must be spearheaded by culture-led regeneration as stipulated by the new Cultural Policy. A culture-led regeneration must therefore drive the Fort St Elmo project as being proposed. The commercial and recreational hubs as envisaged by the brief should thus be subordinate to the overall cultural purpose.</p>	<p>The main objective of the DB is to restore, regenerate and rehabilitate Fort St. Elmo and its environs into a cultural and tourist attraction with supporting amenities to attract visitors and economic activity to the lower end of Valletta.</p>

			<p>Unless economic, social and cultural goals of the regeneration project are holistically approached, the regeneration process will not materialize as being a culture-led project, but merely a restoration project. A democratic culture must also be realized through dialogue with stakeholders who most importantly, should include the residential community of lower Valletta.</p> <p>Creative Clusters</p> <p>It is highly recommended that a scheme for the site, inspired by the concept of 'creative clusters' and based on connective cultural enterprises, be set up. This would be vital for attracting different people, including new and diverse audiences to experience the cultural product. Fort St Elmo is unique and authentic, it can offer a place for work and recreation that is second-to-none for residents of Valletta, Malta and visitors to our Island. The proposed contemporary use of this site needs to ensure a positive impact on the economic, social and physical or environmental return for the community and indeed the whole of the Island's citizens.</p> <p>Recommendations for Use</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A state-of-the-art Wars of Malta Museum 2. An Educational Centre that would host a Peace Institute. 3. Space for indoor sports activities, such as martial arts and a gymnasium. 	<p>MEPA supports a holistic approach to the planning of this site provided it does not unnecessarily hinder the expeditious implementation of the restoration project of the Fort.</p> <p>These small scale traditional and artistic activities are supported by the DB for the Carafa Esplanade.</p> <p>The use of Fort St. Elmo for cultural, educational, tourism related facilities, residential uses, commercial activities including bars, restaurants and office, are supported by the Development Brief. Indoor</p>
--	--	--	---	---

			<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 4. Retail outlets that could host crafts and arts and local food products 5. Bars and restaurants 6. Military tattoo performances 7. Centre for the Army Band 8. Site specific performances around the enceinte, that could run into the night 9. Performances that can include Carnival Arts 10. Artists' Residencies 11. Administrative offices for the cultural entities 12. Making use of the bastion walls <p>St. Elmo Lighthouse Project To commission a contemporary, site-specific work of Public Art situated in place of the old Fort St. Elmo lighthouse. The project will foster and promote a more contemporary artistic heritage which aims to increase awareness of innovative artistic work and in turn stimulates a visual and aesthetic legacy.</p> <p>Further impact studies It is recommended that a longitudinal research on each of these three factors (economic, social and environmental / cultural) is carried out, so as to measure impacts that will evolve over time.</p> <p>MCCA emphasises its belief that such a vibrant mix of cultural services within the Fort's authentic environment will ensure not only</p>	<p>sports facilities can be accommodated as an ancillary use to the proposed tourism accommodation. However it is not MEPA's remit to determine which museums are to be located within the Fort.</p> <p>The DB is also proposing a Heritage Route in the Carafa Enceinte together with the reuse of the historic structures within the Enceinte for cultural purposes</p> <p>The DB does not preclude this approach towards this element of the project.</p> <p>The Brief requires a number of studies to identify, analyse and mitigate against potential impacts from the proposals.</p>
--	--	--	--	--

			economic success but enhance Malta's image and help with tourism development and urban renewal.	
SEB/16	Ms. Bernardette Mercieca f/ Superintendent of Cultural Heritage	21/03/2011	<p>Fort St. Elmo The SCH recognizes that this historic site is in need for restoration and conservation and should be put to good use for the public in terms of educational and cultural activities.</p> <p>The Superintendence needs to approve any demolitions which need to take place in this area. Cultural Heritage Studies may need to be carried out before demolition.</p> <p>Carafa Esplanade, Carafa Enceinte, Land front Ditch, the Examination Centre, the pedestrian precinct, foreshore The SCH agrees with the proposals for these areas. Any removal, extensions and additions to buildings in these areas should be carefully described at a planning application consultation stage to analyse their effect on the existing historic buildings. Landscaping designs in particular the planting of trees and plants and any street furniture, will need to consider ways of not negatively impacting the Fort in any way.</p> <p>The Evans Building The Superintendence does not object to the redevelopment of the Evans Building, and the</p>	<p>Cultural heritage studies are a requirement of the Brief. The DB requires the preparation of Conservation Management Plans to cover the whole DB area and would need to be approved by the SCH as stipulated in the Cultural Heritage Act.</p> <p>The removals, extensions and additions to buildings are subject to a development planning application and during its processing SCH would be consulted.</p> <p>Due to opposing positions from various heritage entities regarding the future of the</p>

			<p>construction of the underground car-park on condition that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The new building replacing the current Evans Building will be compatible architecturally to the pre-war historic urban fabric of Valletta. • The area of the Class B ruins of the Nibbia Chapel and its surrounding areas are to be archaeologically excavated, conserved and restored for the public. • Any cultural heritage remains which may be unearthed during the course of works must be conserved and restored. In the event of discovery, approved plans may need to be amended in order to preserve the cultural heritage remains in situ. <p>Other General Conditions The SCH also stipulated specific conditions on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Excavation and clearing works • Restoration works • Installation of fixtures • Archaeology monitoring • Architecture monitoring • Notification of SCH prior to start of works 	<p>Evans Building the DB cannot provide a firm commitment towards its demolition and excavation for underground car park prior to more thorough studies on the conservation value or otherwise of this building. The DB makes provision for the restoration and incorporation of the archaeological remains of the Nibbia Chapel.</p> <p>The changes to any structures including demolitions are subject to a development planning application and during its processing SCH would be consulted. Archaeological monitoring is a requirement for all development of sites that are deemed to be archaeologically sensitive.</p>
--	--	--	--	--

SEB/17	Mr. Mark Portelli Chairman GHRC	14/03/2011	<p>The DB area includes at least five distinct sites i.e. Fort St. Elmo, Carafa Enceinte, Carafa Esplanade, Evans Building and the examination centre, having the potential of at least five separate projects each with its own set of issues. All reference to the 'project' in the brief should be replaced with appropriate wording in plural.</p> <p><i>9.1 Submission Requirements</i> The submission requirements are to be submitted as part of each individual development planning application rather than comprehensively covering the whole of the DB area.</p> <p><i>9.2 Project Description Statement</i> Screening for the Environmental Impact Assessment should be required as part of each individual development planning application rather than comprehensively covering the whole of the DB area.</p> <p>Proposes that the requirement for a conservation management plan for the Evans building should be removed for the Brief and the Brief allows redevelopment including underground parking.</p>	<p>The Development Brief has been amended accordingly.</p> <p>The restoration elements and the uses of Fort St. Elmo and the Carafa Enceinte have been excluded from the comprehensive planning of the whole DB area.</p> <p>Comprehensive EIA screening is important to avoid possibility of salami slicing of the project</p> <p>Due to opposing positions from various heritage entities regarding the future of the Evans Building the DB cannot provide a firm commitment towards its demolition and excavation for underground car park prior to more thorough studies on the conservation value or otherwise of this building.</p>
--------	------------------------------------	------------	--	---



Appendix D: Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) Screening Proforma

Plan or Programme (PP): Fort St. Elmo and Environs Development Brief 2011

Background and purpose		Contents and scope
<p>The Government, through the Grand Harbour Regeneration Corporation, is promoting the restoration and rehabilitation of the historical military complex of Fort St. Elmo in Valletta into a major cultural and tourist attraction as part of a mixed use scheme including retail, offices and residential uses. This project is aimed to introduce new activities into an economically depressed part of Valletta. The formulation of this Development Brief was a requirement of the Grand Harbour Local Plan approved in 2002.</p>		<p>This development brief is intended to provide the basic framework for the rehabilitation of the Fort and its surroundings. It sets out the various parameters and outlines environmentally compatible strategies to utilise the potential of the area without compromising its unique historical value. It outlines the nature and types of compatible development for Fort St. Elmo and its surroundings and also indicates other buildings and areas in the vicinity for which rehabilitation or redevelopment is considered advisable in line with the overall objectives of this brief. The brief considers the rehabilitation of Fort St. Elmo within the context of the Grand Harbour area including historic conservation and design issues, transportation, services and infrastructure.</p>
Geographical Scale	Proponent	Parent Ministry
Plan covers a land area of around 9.25ha.	MEPA	OPM

Criteria for determining applicability of the SEA Directive as transposed by Legal Notice 497 of 2010	
<p>1. Is the PP prepared and/or adopted by an authority at national, regional or local level or prepared by an authority for adoption?</p>	<p>Yes (MEPA).</p>

and

<p>2. Is the PP required by legislative, regulatory or administrative provisions?</p>	<p>Yes. The formulation of Development Briefs is covered by the Environment and Development Planning Act 2010.</p>
--	--

and

<p>3. Is the PP likely to have significant environmental effects as determined by using the criteria set out in Schedule II of the SEA Regulations (LN 497 of 2010)?</p>	<p>The significance of the likely effects of the proposals in the Development Brief on air quality and the potential for mitigation are unclear. The cumulative impacts on air quality, as a result of these proposals in combination with other relevant projects in the area, are also unclear. These two aspects require further assessment at the strategic level i.e. prior to the submission of individual planning applications, in order to determine: (i) limitations for the range and scale of uses which may be permitted in the area; (ii) the allowable increase in traffic in the affected areas without exceeding the limit values for pollutants in Schedule 7 of LN 478 of 2010; and (iii) possible solutions to improve access to the area through sustainable modes of transport.</p> <p>As the proposed Brief is for a clearly defined local area at Valletta, the potential impacts on air quality from the Brief proposals and their cumulative impacts with other projects should either:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • be assessed at the Brief stage through a tailored SEA or • through a comprehensive EIA for the Brief area <p>in order to address the likely environmental impacts holistically and before submission of individual planning applications.</p>
---	--

and

<p>4. Is the PP prepared for one or more of the sectors listed in Article 4(2) of the SEA Regulations (LN 497 of 2010) and (Article 3(2) of the Directive), namely agriculture, forestry, fisheries, energy, industry, transport, waste management, water management, telecommunications, tourism, town and country planning or land use?</p>	<p>Yes. Town and Country Planning or land use.</p>
--	--

and

<p>5. Does the PP set the framework for future development consents of project listed in the EIA Directive as transposed by Legal Notice 114 of 2007?</p>	<p>Yes.</p>
--	-------------

Or

<p>6. Does the PP require an appropriate assessment under the Habitats Directive as transposed by Legal Notice 257 of 2003?</p>	<p>No as there are no EU designations on the site or in the vicinity of the site.</p>
--	---

or

<p>7. Does the PP, other than those areas indicated in 4 above, referred in Article 4(2) of the SEA Regulations (LN 497 of 2010) (Article 3 (2) of the Directive), set the framework for future development consent of projects and are likely to have significant environmental effects?</p>	<p>No.</p>
--	------------

And

<p>8. Has the PP started after 21 July 2004 or will be adopted after 21 July 2006?</p>	<p>Yes.</p>
---	-------------

Applicability of the SEA Directive		
Definitely requires to be subject to an SEA	Uncertain	Does not require to be subjected to an SEA
		X
Opinion on SEA Requirement		
<p>An SEA is not required as the potential impacts on air quality and their cumulative impacts with other projects shall be addressed through a comprehensive EIA covering the whole of the Development Brief Area except for any of the restoration elements on any part of the Development Brief Area and the uses of Fort St. Elmo and the Carafa Enceinte. The Brief can be reasonably considered as either a small-scale plan or a large-scale project, and experience suggests that duplication of procedures would not result in added value. In this regard, the EIA process is considered as a more effective tool, as it can be directly conducive to conclusive decision-making with more tangibly enforceable specifications. The significant impacts (e.g. on air quality, which is envisaged as the main issue) would result from the commercial proposals and not from the restoration and the ancillary cultural use (as long as the cultural use is interpreted in a reasonably narrow sense, excluding major commercial amenities).</p>		